

PATENT COOPERATION TREATY

PCT

Rec'd

PTO 07 OCT 2004
16/510450

INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY EXAMINATION REPORT

(PCT Article 36 and Rule 70)

REC'D 02 APR 2004

WIPO PCT



Applicant's or agent's file reference PCT-7050	FOR FURTHER ACTION See Notification of Transmittal of International Preliminary Examination Report (Form PCT/PEA/416)	
International application No. PCT/AT 03/00214	International filing date (day/month/year) 08.04.2003	Priority date (day/month/year) 09.04.2002
International Patent Classification (IPC) or both national classification and IPC A61K31/205		
Applicant SIGMA-TAU HEALTHSCIENCE S.P.A. et al.		

- This international preliminary examination report has been prepared by this International Preliminary Examining Authority and is transmitted to the applicant according to Article 36.
- This REPORT consists of a total of 4 sheets, including this cover sheet.

☐ This report is also accompanied by ANNEXES, i.e. sheets of the description, claims and/or drawings which have been amended and are the basis for this report and/or sheets containing rectifications made before this Authority (see Rule 70.16 and Section 607 of the Administrative Instructions under the PCT).

 These annexes consist of a total of sheets.

- This report contains indications relating to the following items:
 - I ☒ Basis of the opinion
 - II ☐ Priority
 - III ☐ Non-establishment of opinion with regard to novelty, inventive step and industrial applicability
 - IV ☐ Lack of unity of invention
 - V ☒ Reasoned statement under Rule 66.2(a)(ii) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability; citations and explanations supporting such statement
 - VI ☐ Certain documents cited
 - VII ☐ Certain defects in the international application
 - VIII ☐ Certain observations on the international application

Date of submission of the demand 10.10.2003	Date of completion of this report 31.03.2004
Name and mailing address of the international preliminary examining authority:  European Patent Office D-80298 Munich Tel. +49 89 2399 - 0 Tx: 523656 epmu d Fax: +49 89 2399 - 4465	Authorized Officer Pacreu Largo, M Telephone No. +49 89 2399-7851 

**INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY
EXAMINATION REPORT**

International application No. PCT/IT 03/00214

I. Basis of the report

1. With regard to the **elements** of the international application (*Replacement sheets which have been furnished to the receiving Office in response to an invitation under Article 14 are referred to in this report as "originally filed" and are not annexed to this report since they do not contain amendments (Rules 70.16 and 70.17):*

Description, Pages

1-10 as originally filed

Claims, Numbers

1-15 as originally filed

2. With regard to the **language**, all the elements marked above were available or furnished to this Authority in the language in which the international application was filed, unless otherwise indicated under this item.

These elements were available or furnished to this Authority in the following language: , which is:

- ☐ the language of a translation furnished for the purposes of the international search (under Rule 23.1(b)).
☐ the language of publication of the international application (under Rule 48.3(b)).
☐ the language of a translation furnished for the purposes of international preliminary examination (under Rule 55.2 and/or 55.3).

3. With regard to any **nucleotide and/or amino acid sequence** disclosed in the international application, the international preliminary examination was carried out on the basis of the sequence listing:

- ☐ contained in the international application in written form.
☐ filed together with the international application in computer readable form.
☐ furnished subsequently to this Authority in written form.
☐ furnished subsequently to this Authority in computer readable form.
☐ The statement that the subsequently furnished written sequence listing does not go beyond the disclosure in the international application as filed has been furnished.
☐ The statement that the information recorded in computer readable form is identical to the written sequence listing has been furnished.

4. The amendments have resulted in the cancellation of:

- ☐ the description, pages:
☐ the claims, Nos.:
☐ the drawings, sheets:

5. ☐ This report has been established as if (some of) the amendments had not been made, since they have been considered to go beyond the disclosure as filed (Rule 70.2(c)).

(Any replacement sheet containing such amendments must be referred to under item 1 and annexed to this report.)

6. Additional observations, if necessary:

**INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY
EXAMINATION REPORT**

International application No. **PCT/IT 03/00214**

**V. Reasoned statement under Article 35(2) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability;
citations and explanations supporting such statement**

1. Statement

Novelty (N)

Yes: Claims 1-15
No: Claims

PASUAL

Inventive step (IS)

Yes: Claims
No: Claims 1-15

Industrial applicability (IA)

Yes: Claims 1-15
No: Claims

2. Citations and explanations

see separate sheet

Re Item V

Reasoned statement under Rule 66.2(a)(ii) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability; citations and explanations supporting such statement

1. The documents cited in the International Search Report (ISR) are consecutively numbered D1-D6 in the order of their listing. If not indicated otherwise, reference is made to the passages cited in said ISR.
2. The subject-matter of claims 1 to 15 is novel according to Art. 33(2) PCT, since the prior art does not describe the use of L-carnitine, acetyl L-carnitine and propionyl L- carnitine, all 3 in combination, for the treatment of oligoasthenospermia.
3. The combined use of L-carnitine and acetyl-L-carnitine for the treatment of oligoasthenospermia is known from D1.

It is also known from D2 that acyl L-carnitines, e.g. propionyl L-carnitine, are useful for the treatment of oligoasthenospermias.

According to the application (page 6, fifth paragraph) the combination of the three compounds would result in a significant increase of the sperm motility and concentration as compared to the combination of L-carnitine and acetyl-L-carnitine.

However, in the absence of appropriate evidence (e.g. experimental data) showing that the present combination exerts a synergistic effect over the effect of the 3 single "carnitines" or over the combination of D1 and propionyl L- carnitine, an inventive step for the subject-matter of claims 1 to 15 cannot be acknowledged in the sense of Art. 33(3) PCT.